

**Del Monte Forest Property Owners (DMFPO)
Hiking and Equestrian Trails Committee (HETC) DRAFT Meeting Minutes
Tuesday, April 3, 2024 4:00 p.m.
PBCSD Training Room**

Leadership present: *DMFPO Board Members:* Bob Ogle / Ned Van Roekel / Lisa Huntley
DMFPO Member: Katie Spitz

Members Present: Kirsten Stember

Resources present: *Pebble Beach Company (PBC):* Micah Hawbaker / Shawn Casey / Peter Brown
Pebble Beach Community Services District: Nick Becker / Rick Verbanec
OSAC: Bob Ogle / Rick Verbanec

Others Present: Laura Paxton, DMFPO Administrator
Linda Killar, Kari Lyddon, Shari Lasher, Leah Andrews, Steve Brown, Vainca Bauman,
Kathy Huff, Lynn Perkins, Lois Hazard, Tracey Liebig

1. **Announcements** – None
2. **Call to Order** – The meeting was called to order at 4:03 p.m.
3. **Acceptance/Modification of Agenda** – Accepted
4. **Public Comment** – Many in attendance commented in opposition to, or seeking alternatives to, the closure of the Pebble Beach Equestrian Center (PBEC). Kirsten Stember, referring to a letter she had submitted to the Committee via email on April 2nd and was provided at this meeting (attached to these minutes), informed that an amended copy of the letter would be submitted. She referred to the three items that the Coalition was requesting: 1) Adding an agenda item to the April 8, 2024 DMFPO Board Meeting addressing the PBC closure of the PBEC so concerns can be presented; 2) Inviting the PBC leadership to do a formal presentation to the DMFPO as a special single item meeting on its plans for the PBEC land since no community meetings, public meetings or notice was given; and 3) Inquiring into the process for registering the PBEC as a historical cultural landscape resource in continuous operation for 100 years. She stated that the Coalition has circulated a petition and has collected 2,531 signatures. Lois Hazard noted the Coalition website gives testimony on how the PBEC could be a viable operation. The importance of a safe, convenient access point for dropping/collecting horses without the PBEC was discussed. Shari Lyddon felt SFB Morse himself would take an enlightened capitalistic approach to sustaining the PBEC and its rich history. Director of PBC Security, Peter Brown stated he appreciated the comments and would provide them to those appropriate at PBC for consideration of any statement. He assured that PBC had no plan to deny equestrians trailering their horses to trail access points, that all trails would remain accessible to the public. He stated that PBC would communicate as effectively as possible any developing plans for the area. He stated he would not respond to inquiries regarding documents pertaining to the matter. The Committee took all the comments under advisement. DMFPO Board President, Lynn Anderson assured Chair Ogle the item would be on the April 8, 2024 board meeting agenda.
5. **Minutes** – It was moved/seconded/carried to approve the January 3, 2024, minutes.
6. **Pebble Beach Community Services District (PBCSD)/Cal Fire** – Deputy General Manager Becker reported the PBCSD Board at its March 29th meeting heard the Fire Prevention Open Space Management Plan for the upcoming fiscal year; work on the interior areas of open spaces is planned along with road edge upkeep focused on in previous years. The goats will arrive the beginning of May and will treat various areas for 12 weeks. There are no firm plans yet for treating the “matchstick” area until project resources are allocated.
7. **Pebble Beach Company** – Micah Hawbaker reported PBC has cleared 80-90% of the trails of storm debris/downed trees. Some trees fallen into other trees are yet to be removed, and areas where the ground is still wet are yet to be cleared and trail drainage improved. Most trail markers have been replaced in the last 1-1/2 years, many in the last two months, and will be replaced on-going.

8. Trail Maintenance Status – Chair Ogle emphasized the purview of the Committee is to maintain the trails and support public access sites for equestrians. He expected a challenge having eyes for trail maintenance needs when and if PBEC closure causes equestrian use to dwindle. Vainca Bauman had no reports of issues; she plans to continue riding the trails a couple times a month. Kirsten Stember felt the build out in the Indian Village area has made trails there unsafe; she thanked PBC for a great job clearing the open pit dunes area trail and felt it the best trail for horses right now as the ground is hard packed. A meeting was scheduled for April 18th at 2 or 3:00pm with HETC members, PBC, and will arrange with MPCC to clarify the Green Trail Path along 17-mile Drive: whether on the ocean side up to China Rock, crossing over the road to the MPCC side inside the fence to the beach house and then recrossing back to the ocean side Green Trail; or cross to the MPCC inside fence at Bird Rock all the way to the beach house; anyone else is welcome to attend.

Lois Hazard suggested materials be distributed, or a sign at the entrance gates be placed that informs that horses (and hikers) are allowed on the trails and to be mindful of them: Chair Ogle stated this need for public awareness is clear and he and Peter Brown continue dialogue and effort.

Kirsten Stember remarked that in her review of the PBC build out plan, she found noted that four more miles of trails would be added to the trail system in the upper fire road area, increasing trail mileage from 27 to 31.

9. New Business – None

10. Old Business – Peter Brown related that the signs on the trails skirting Poppy Hills Golf Course, though confusing, will remain per Poppy Hills/NCGA to keep trail users off the course; Poppy Hills/NCGA will however allow added directional or other signage on the posts below its no trespassing signs.

11. Adjournment – The meeting adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

Next Meeting Wednesday, July 10, 2024 4:00pm

Respectfully submitted by Laura Paxton

Pebble Beach Equestrian Coalition

www.pbecoalition.com

info@pbecoalition.com

April 2, 2024

Mr. Bob Ogle, Director
Hiking & Equestrian Trails Committee
Del Monte Forest Property Owners
3101 Forest Lake Road
Pebble Beach, CA 93953
E-Mail: office@dmfpo.org

AGENDA ITEM #4 Public Comment: April 3, 2024 meeting

Dear Mr. Ogle:

This letter is sent in advance of the Del Monte Forest Property Owners April 3, 2024 Hiking and Equestrian Trails Committee meeting for review and discussion under Agenda Item #4 Public Comment.

As listed on the website in the Del Monte Forest Property Owners bylaws regarding purpose:
2) **PURPOSES: The specific and primary purposes are to promote and preserve the high standards of the residential community of Del Monte Forest in Monterey County, California; to obtain such additional community facilities as are necessary for the safety, comfort, health, and welfare of residents of the area; to cooperate in the proper and desirable development of the Del Monte Forest area; and to promote harmony, civic enthusiasm, and community pride.**

The Pebble Beach Equestrian Coalition, (PBECOalition), is an informal association of local equestrians, **including members of the Del Monte Forest Home Owners, who are dedicated to preserving the 100-year history of the Pebble Beach Equestrian Center (PBEC). We OPPOSE the actions taken by the Pebble Beach Company, (PBC), on March 4, 2024 to permanently close the Pebble Beach Equestrian Center (PBEC) effective June 30, 2024.**

The PBEC land has been historically and culturally zoned equestrian by the Monterey County Planning Commission. Members of the Del Monte Forest Home Owners were granted in perpetuity Codes, Conditions and Restrictions (CCRs) in 1967 by the Del Monte Properties (**APPENDIX A**) equestrian access for equestrian recreational activities at PBEC. The PBEC is listed in the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan adopted in 1987 and it is also listed in the Monterey County Coastal Implementation Plan – Part 5 Regulations for Development in the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan Area (Chapter 20.147) (**APPENDIX B**).

For the current “proper or desirable development of the Del Monte Forest area,” PBECOalition does not believe the PBC and their golfers are cooperating in a peaceful coexistence to promote harmony, civic enthusiasm and community pride with the equestrian community who are members of Del Monte Forest Property Owners. In contrary, PBC has caused great hardship due to the lack of inclusion and transparency with current property owners and the greater Monterey County residents. For the past 100 years, there has been an established historical precedent and legacy of Del Monte Forest Home Owners’ maintaining access to PBEC equestrian recreational activities and facilities as part of our recreational equestrian activities in the Del Monte Forest.

The PBEC facility provides the necessary safety, comfort, health, and welfare of the Del Monte Forest Home Owners who are equestrians and truly love their horses and horseback riding. The closure of the PBEC eliminates the diversity and opportunities for expanded equestrian recreational access for Del Monte Forest homeowners; youth; the greater community of Monterey County; and tourist who come from around the world to visit the over 30 miles of coastal equestrian trails. The PBEC Coalition is asking for effective leadership from the Del Monte Forest Home Owners, to ensure that the future generations of equestrians and public thrive over the next 100 years.

The history of horses and the equestrian life in Monterey is extensive and both share the same hiking-equestrian trails in the Del Monte Forest. They are the interlocking fabric of our local culture, with its roots going back centuries. PBEC is the LAST equestrian facility in continuous operation for 100 years, built with old growth redwood trees from 1923. PBC stated that it would take, "over 15 million dollars in renovations". The barns do not need to be demolished for a new equestrian center to be built. **The barn stall's redwood is in good condition and it does not cost 15 million dollars to renovate existing barns – repair - sand and paint.**

Addressing social equity and fairness: Our nation's public parks and recreation services should be equally accessible and available to **ALL PEOPLE** regardless of income levels, ethnicity, gender, ability, or age. By closing PBEC, affordable boarding and public trail rides are CANCELLED into the Del Monte Forest and along the 30 miles of Coastal Equestrian Trails. PBC's decision is neither equitable or fair. Further, not everyone that rides these trails has their own horse, and not everyone that has their own horse, has a trailer.

Converting equestrian zoned land and historical use into more golf recreational activities goes against the regulations for development and limits the promotion and harmony between Pebble Beach golfers and Del Monte Forest Home Owners who are equestrians. More golf storage on public access land is not in the best interest of:

- the Del Monte Forest Home Owners;
- the public who enjoy equestrian recreational activities and do not own horses;
- nor does it honor the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan or the Del Monte Forest Home Owners who have CCRs in perpetuity with the right to enjoy equestrian recreational activities and facilities at PBEC.

Our area is home to the nation's wealthiest golf courses owned by PBC. Today's value of PBC per Google Search is more than 3.5 billion dollars. The Del Monte Forest Home Owners have supported PBC over *many* decades of public easements, development permits and zoning code changes for the growth of golf on the Monterey Peninsula. In 2013 homes were built with a promise by PBC that a new equestrian facility at PBEC would be built. Plans were filed with the Monterey Planning Commission but never completed. On March 4, 2024, PBC claims the PBEC is not viable and they have to close. Based on results, the PBC has neglected maintenance and marketing of equestrian programs which would have ensured that the PBEC remained as financially successful as was experienced under previous management prior to 2013.

The Del Monte Forest Home Owners are respectfully requesting the Hiking and Equestrian Trails Committee report back at the April 8, 2024 Del Monte Forest Home Owner Board of Directors meeting to act including but not limited to:

1. Adding an agenda item to the next April 8, 2024 Del Monte Forest Home Owner General Board Meeting addressing the PBC closure of the PBEC so members of the Del Monte Home Owners can present their concerns;
2. Invite the PBC leadership to do a formal presentation to the Home Owners of the Del Monte Forest Home Owners as a special single item meeting on what the PBC's proposed plans are for the PBEC land since no community meetings, public meetings or notice was given to the Del Monte Forest Home Owners; and
3. Inquire to the historical cultural process for registering the PBEC as a historical cultural landscape resource in continuous operation for 100 years.

Thank you in advance for your consideration of the above requested items. Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

Kirsten Parrish-Stember

KIRSTEN PARRISH-STEMBER

Member, PBECcoalition

Email: kstemberdmfc@gmail.com

CC: Ms. Lynn Anderson, President, Nominations/Bylaws Chair, Del Monte Forest Home Owners

10.

ORIGINAL

C 51518 REEL 514 PAGE 422 ORIGINAL
RECORDED AT REQUEST OF 94 27

COAST-COUNTIES LAND TITLE CO.

CCLTCO # 10 2200-13
Accommodation Only

JUL 20 3 35 PM '57 80

DEPARTMENT OF READER
COUNTY OF MONTEREY
EASEMENT DECLARATION AND AGREEMENT
(FOLG FIELD)

KNOW ALL MEN BY THESE PRESENTS: REEL 514 PAGE 422

WHEREAS, the undersigned, DEL MONTE PROPERTIES COMPANY, is the owner of a large tract of land situate in the County of Monterey, State of California, which is adapted for and principally devoted to subdivision residential use, and on which said Company maintains a lodge or hotel and also golf courses, tennis courts, riding stables and other recreational facilities for the accommodation of residents and the public; and

WHEREAS, a portion of said tract, which portion is described in Exhibit "A" annexed hereto and shown on the map annexed hereto (designated Exhibit "A-1"), is wholly owned by said undersigned, is not and never has been used for residential purposes, but is uniquely suitable for equestrian sports and exhibitions, and for many years has been used exclusively for such purposes, and it is desirable that such use be continued; and

WHEREAS, a portion of said tract, which portion is designated in Exhibit "B" annexed hereto, and is situate adjacent to and in the vicinity of said lands described in said Exhibit "A", is suitable for residential purposes and will be benefited by the maintenance of said lands described in said Exhibit "A" for use exclusively for recreational purposes; and

WHEREAS, the undersigned, in furtherance of the general plan to benefit said lands described in said

C 51518

Vertical text on the right edge of the page, likely a scanning artifact or reference number.

Exhibit "D" and each of the lots therein and the owners thereof, intends by the execution and recordation of this instrument and the conveyances of such lots, as hereinafter provided, to subject said lands described in said Exhibit "A" to a negative easement, right, covenant and restriction precluding and forbidding their use for any purposes other than recreational purposes;

NOW, THEREFORE, said undersigned, for itself, its successors and assigns, hereby declares, covenants and provides, as follows:

Said lands described in said Exhibit "A" (excepting only as hereinafter otherwise provided) shall not hereafter by said undersigned, its successors, assigns, agents, lessees or licensees, be used for any purposes other than recreational purposes, as herein defined; and to that end a negative easement, right, covenant and restriction precluding and forbidding the use by said undersigned, its successors or assigns, of any part of said lands described in said Exhibit "A" for any purposes other than recreational purposes is hereby created, declared, entered into and reserved for the benefit of, and shall run with, said lands described in said Exhibit "B" and each and all of the lots therein; and such easement and right is conveyed and assigned to, and such covenant is made and entered into for the express benefit of, the several owners of record thereof, their heirs, administrators, successors and assigns; and all conveyances of said lots within said lands described in said Exhibit "B" hereafter made or executed by said undersigned,

APPENDIX B

PROOF THAT THE PEBBLE BEACH EQUESTRIAN CENTER IS A DEEMED AND IDENTIFIED AS A PUBLIC ACCESS AREA TO BE SAVED AND MAINTAINED IN PERPETUITY. Excerpts are from:

MONTEREY COUNTY COASTAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

PART 5

**Regulations for Development
in the Del Monte Forest Land Use Plan Area (Chapter 20.147)**

Certified by the California Coastal Commission May 9, 2012

**Adopted by the
Monterey County Board of Supervisors May 22, 2012**

Excerpt:

Pebble Beach Company is the owner of the vast majority of the undeveloped land in Del Monte Forest and it has developed a Concept Plan that includes dedication and preservation of most of its undeveloped land, and development and redevelopment of other areas. This Concept Plan includes additions, improvements, and/or redevelopment at certain Pebble Beach Company visitor-serving and commercial facilities, including The Lodge at Pebble Beach, The Inn at Spanish Bay, the **Equestrian Center**, and the Pebble Beach Driving Range.The remainder of the Concept Plan provides for long-term preservation, enhancement, and management of undeveloped preservation areas as protected habitat in perpetuity.

I. Requirements Applicable to Public Access and Recreation

As a condition of approval of the first development in the Concept Plan, the Pebble Beach Company shall be required to prepare and implement a Del Monte Forest Public Access Management Plan that is subject to review and approval by the County and the Executive Director of the Coastal Commission. The Plan shall clearly describe the manner in which general public access in the Del Monte Forest is to be managed and provided (including through improvements to **existing access areas** and development of new access areas, as appropriate), with the objective of maximizing public access to **all major access points** (e.g., all shoreline access locations, trails, parking areas, destinations, facilities, etc.) and all related public access areas, and maximizing utility and enjoyment of all such public access features

1. Public Access Areas. **All public access areas** in the Del Monte Forest shall be clearly identified as such on the Plan, including through maps, site plans, elevations (as appropriate), and photographs of each access area clearly identifying all elements of access so that it is clear what areas are available for public access and use.

(a) 17-Mile Drive, including bike access and bike lanes.

(b) All defined accessways adjacent to 17-Mile Drive (including at Moss Beach, Point Joe, China Rock, Bird Rock, Seal Rock, Fanshell Beach, Cypress Point, Crocker Grove, Lone Cypress, Ghost Tree/Pescadero Point, Shepherds Knoll, Huckleberry Hill, etc.).

(c) All trails along 17-Mile Drive and the shoreline.

(d) All public access areas at The Inn at Spanish Bay, including public access parking and trail connectivity.

(e) All public access areas at The Lodge at Pebble Beach and the Pebble Beach commercial core area, including access through the commercial area and Lodge to and including Stillwater Cove and Sloat accessways, and including parking provisions (including in the commercial area and at Peter Hay, Casa Palmero, and the Beach and Tennis Club).

(f) All public access areas at the new hotel site at the former Spyglass Quarry (at LUP Area M).

(g) Pebble Beach Company golf courses and the Pebble Beach Equestrian Center, specific only to their public access and use parameters.

(j) Access areas in the Del Monte Forest owned by the Del Monte Forest Foundation (e.g., Indian Village).

(k) All access areas and improvements identified in former LUP Appendix B (as certified in the original LUP in 1984).

(l) All access areas and improvements required as part of the Spanish Bay development pursuant to coastal development permit 3-84-226.

(m) New access areas to be developed as part of the Concept Plan, including those necessary to offset public access impacts from Concept Plan development.

Public Access Areas and Amenities Maintained. The Pebble Beach Company shall manage and maintain all Del Monte Forest public access areas and related amenities associated with the Plan on Pebble Beach Company land (and on land for which Pebble Beach Company has assumed such obligation) in their approved state and consistent with all Plan provisions in perpetuity.

CONCLUSION

Places for average equestrian boarders who do not own their own facilities are disappearing. The next generation of equestrians and places for kids to learn about horses and take riding lessons is critically limited. The community of Pebble Beach deeply values the PBEC and wants to find new solutions to the June 30, 2024 closure.

The PBEC coalition thanks you in advance for your consideration to direct staff and determine the zoning and land use rights of the PBEC.

its successors or assigns, shall contain a provision (the blanks whereof shall be appropriately filled) in substantially the following form:

"The Easement Declaration and Agreement executed by Grantor, dated _____, 1967, and recorded _____, 1967, in Volume _____, Records of Monterey County, California, page _____, is hereby incorporated herein by reference, and the covenants, restrictions and other provisions thereof are hereby adopted and agreed to by the parties hereto and declared to be applicable to this conveyance and to said parties, their heirs, administrators, successors and assigns. Grantor conveys and assigns to Grantee (and the heirs, administrators, successors and assigns of the Grantee), as appurtenant to the premises hereby conveyed, the easement and rights provided for and described in said Easement Declaration and Agreement for the benefit of the land hereby conveyed and of the other lands designated therein."

The covenants and restrictions herein referred to are and shall be without warranty, and enforceable by the remedy of injunction only and not by action for damages.

The term "recreational purposes," as used herein, means and includes polo, equestrian riding and jumping, steeple chase and equestrian competitions, and other sports and activities of any nature approved by said Del Monte Properties Company, its successors or assigns, and also horse, dog and other exhibitions and shows conducted by or with the consent of said Company, its successors or assigns.

Notwithstanding anything to the contrary contained herein, neither this Agreement, nor said easement, right, covenant or restriction, nor said provision hereinabove set forth incorporated in any such conveyance, is intended or shall be construed, to preclude said undersigned, its successors, assigns, lessees, or licensees from erecting,